

APPENDIX 1

A BRIEF CHRONOLOGICAL SURVEY OF RESEARCH

By Mr. Nasir Ahmad, Former Editor, *The Light*, Lahore

Hazrat Mirza Ghulam Ahmad, Founder of the Ahmadiyya Movement in Islam for the first time in the history of religion, under Divine inspiration, announced to the world in 1890 that Jesus Christ did not die on the Cross. In 1890 he wrote a comprehensive book *Izalah Auham* in which by extensively quoting from the Bible and the Holy Quran, he conclusively proved that Jesus Christ escaped the accursed death on the Cross and that he set out secretly from Palestine in search of the "Lost Tribes of Israel". This discussion is found almost in all his eighty books in Urdu, Persian and Arabic.

History bears evidence that in 721 B.C. Sargaon II captured the Kingdom of Israel and all the Jewish inhabitants were captured and exiled. Most of these tribes came to Iran, Afghanistan and India and settled down in these lands. Thus the Founder of the Ahmadiyyah Movement adduced historical evidence to prove that Jewish tribes did settle in these countries and Jesus Christ in order to fulfil his Divine Mission (Matt., 15:24) visited them and finally at the age of 125 years died in Kashmir. This aspect of the subject has been dealt with by Hazrat Mirza Ghulam Ahmad in his following books: 1. *Imam al-Hujjah* (1894), 2. *Noor al-Qur'an* (1895), 3. *Noor al-Haque* Part II (1898), 4. *Raz-i-Haqiqat* (1898), 5. *Tuhfa-i-Golarwiyah* (1900), 6. *Al-huda* (1902), 7. *Barahin-i-Ahmadiyyah* Part V (1908), 8. *Nuzool-al-Masih* (1909).

In 1899, Khalifa Noor al-Din of Jalalpur Jattan, (Dist Gujrat), a devoted disciple of Hazrat Mirza Sahib, who had lived in Kashmir for quite some time, pointed out to him that there existed in Srinagar a tomb of a prophet Yus Asaf or Isa Sahib who came to Kashmir from a foreign country. On directions from Hazrat Mirza Sahib, for making further investigations into the matter, Khalifa Noor al-Din went to Srinagar and stayed there for four months, collected evidence and procured 556 signatures to the fact that the tomb was in fact that of Jesus Christ. He also brought sketch of the Tomb. Later, Maulvi Muhammad Abdullah, a leading advocate of Srinagar collected further evidence in this behalf. All these facts along with other historical, linguistic, ethnic, cultural evidence and a map showing the route taken by Jesus Christ while coming to India were documented in *Masih Hindustan Main* a unique and basic research work on the subject. This book by Hazrat Mirza Ghulam Ahmad Sahib was written sometime in 1899, but with the intention of adding more evidence, its publication was kept in abeyance, and was finally published after the Founder's death in 1908. Its English translation was published from Qadian in 1944.

It would be worthwhile here to briefly summarize the contents of the book, *Masih Hindustan Main* Originally the book was intended to consist of ten chapters. When published it consisted only of four chapters. The first chapter deals with Jesus' escape from death on the Cross and his travels towards the Eastern countries in the light of the Bible. The second adduces evidence on the escape of Jesus from death on the

Cross from the Quran and authentic traditions of the Holy Prophet Muhammad. The third chapter enlists evidence from more than 33 renowned books of *Materia Medica* that carry formula of *marham-i-Isa* (Jesus' ointment) and shows that it was the same ointment which was applied to the wounds of Jesus Christ caused by nailing him on the Cross. According to the Author the list exceeds one thousand but he has selected some of the well-known oriental and European works of *Materia Medica* compiled by Jewish, Christian and Muslim medical experts. The fourth and last chapter consists of: (a) historical evidence from Islamic sources about Jesus' travels to Nasibain and through Iran to Afghanistan, then entering India and finally reaching Kashmir. (b) Evidence from Buddhist sources establishing that Jesus came to India in fulfilment of a prophecy of Buddha that after five hundred years of his death, another Buddha would come and revive his true teachings (Ref. Dr. Herman Oldenburg. "Buddha", p. 142). His name would be *Mitya* (Messiah in Hebrew became *Metteya* in Pali language). It has enumerated the similarities between the teachings of Buddha and Jesus Christ, their manner of expression, and their method of preaching through parables. It also adduces authentic proof that Jesus Christ has been mentioned by the name of *Mi-Shi-Hu* in books written in Tibet during the 7th century C.E. (Ref. *A record of the Buddhist religion* by I Tsing translated by G. Takakusu). (c) That the Ten Lost Tribes of Israel migrated from Jerusalem and settled down in Afghanistan and Kashmir, and Jesus Christ came here in search of them to fulfil his Divine mission.

Among the articles written by Ahmadi writers on this subject mention may be made of the following:

(1) "An Important discovery regarding Jesus Christ" By Maulana Muhammad Ali; published in the monthly *Review of Religions*, Qadian, October 1902, pp. 421-424.

(2) "Jesus did not die on the Cross" By Hazrat Mirza Ghulam Ahmad; published in the monthly *Review of Religions*, Qadian: September 1903, pp. 336-342.

(3) "The Tomb of Jesus at Srinagar" by Hazrat Mirza Ghulam Ahmad; published in monthly *Review of Religions*, Qadian; September 1903, pp. 336-342.

(4) "Jesus among the Ten Lost Israelite Tribes in the East" by Maulana Muhammad Ali; published in the monthly *Review of Religions*, Qadian; January 1903, pages 8-19, February 1903, pages 51-66; May 1903, pages 181-192; June 1903, pages 220-225; October 1903, pp. 393-399.

(5) "The Tomb of Jesus at Srinagar" by Maulana Sher Ali; published in the monthly *Review of Religions*, Qadian May 1903, pages 197-204; November-December 1903, pages 457-466; May 1904, pp. 186-200.

(6) "Christ's so-called death on the Cross" by Maulana Muhammad Ali; published in the monthly *Review of Religions*, Qadian June 1904, pages 228-234.

(7) "The story of the Crucifixion" by Maulana Muhammad Ali; published in the monthly *Review of Religions*, Qadian February 1909; pp. 49-66.

(8) "The Lost Tribes of Israel" by Maulana Muhammad Ali; published in the monthly *Review of Religions*, Qadian November 1909, pp. 487-496.

(9) "The Escape of Jesus from the Cross" by Maulana Muhammad Ali; published in the monthly *Review of Religions*, Qadian June 1910, pages 221-256; December 1911, pages 509-516.

(10) "Did Jesus the Christ Live?" by Maulana Muhammad Ali; published in the monthly *Review of Religions*, Qadian August 1912, pages 328-352; September 1912, pages 385-386.

In 1935, Mufti Muhammad Sadiq, another disciple of Hazrat Mirza Sahib, made further researches about the Tomb of Jesus in Srinagar and published it in the form of a book, *Qabr-i-Masih*.

The subject of Jesus' visit to and demise in Kashmir, after escaping death on the Cross, has also been discussed in the following books:

(1) *Isa der Kashmir* by Muhammad Yusuf Peshawari, Qadian, 1934.

(2) *Where did Jesus die?* by J. D. Shams, Qadian, 1945.

(3) *The Tomb of Jesus* by Sufi Motiur Rahman Bengali, Qadian, 1946.

(4) *History of the Prophets* by Maulana Muhammad Ali; Chapter 19; "Jesus Christ" Lahore, 1946.

(5) *The life of Ahmed* by A.R. Dard; Chapter 65: 'Jesus in India'; Lahore, 1948.

(6) *Jesus in Kashmir*; Rabwah, 1952.

The scholarly writings of Hazrat Mirza Sahib and later researches by his devoted disciples adducing evidence that the tomb of Prophet Yus Asaf at Srinagar is that of Jesus Christ created so much interest in the Christian circles of India that in 1939, Lord Irwin, a devout Christian and Viceroy of India, went to Srinagar to see the Tomb himself.

In the early forties, Khwaja Nazir Ahmad, Bar-at-law, son of Khwaja Kamal-ud-Din, the First Muslim Missionary to the West and Founder of Woking Muslim Mission, England, started collecting more detailed and documentary proofs with regard to the fact that the tomb of Yus Asaf or *Shahazada Nabi* was that of Jesus Christ. He not only established historical, cultural, ethnic, linguistic and religious affinities between the people of Kashmir and the Jews of Palestine, but procured indisputable evidence and documents regarding the tomb of Jesus Christ. He disclosed that Jesus along with Judas Thomas visited Taxila, and that Mary, while coming to Kashmir along with Jesus, died at Murree where her tomb is still found. In this connection Khwaja Nazir Ahmad studied hundreds of books, scores of rare manuscripts and extensively toured Kashmir. In August 1945 he started writing a series of articles in the monthly *Islamic Review* under the heading: "Jesus son of Mary" which contin-

ued till November 1948. Finally his book, *Jesus in Heaven on Earth* came out in 1952 which encompassed remarkable research on this subject with rare photographs and maps, adducing irrefutable evidence that Jesus Christ finally settled in Kashmir and after preaching for 125 years died there and was buried in Mohalla Khanyar, Srinagar. The book has gone into five editions. The last edition came out in January, 1972.

Mr Abdul Aziz Shora, a well-known journalist, and editor of the weekly *Roshni*, Srinagar, Kashmir accompanied Khwaja Nazir Ahmad, author of "Jesus in Heaven on Earth" to various places in Kashmir during the latter's research work. After the partition of the Indo-Pakistan subcontinent, Mr. Aziz Shora, continued his efforts to further dig out facts and evidence on the subject by visiting far off places in Kashmir. He published fruits of his efforts in a special number of his weekly *Roshni* in 1953.

In May 1958, Rev. Dr. Charles Francis Potter, a world-renowned religious leader and scholar, wrote "The lost years of Jesus revealed". This book was published by Gold Medal Books of Fawcett Publications of U.S.A. This book is based on the newest discoveries of the Dead Sea Scrolls, on the life of Jesus Christ, during the so-called, eighteen silent years between the ages of twelve and thirty. The author has tried to prove that during these "lost years" Jesus was a student at the Essene School and has admitted about the startling parallels between the doctrines and vocabulary of Jesus and those of Essenes and their "Teacher of Righteousness," who was probably Crucified nearly a century before the birth of Jesus Christ.

This subject has proved to be of such absorbing interest and such great significance that no year passes without some new books and articles about it being published. A few of these are enumerated below:

1. *Marqas ka Akhri Waraq* (Last page of Gospel of St. Mark) by Sh. Abdul Qadir; Rabwah, September, 1959.

This page has now been omitted from the Gospel of St. Mark. It reads: "And all the things announced to those about Peter briefly, they spread about and after that Jesus himself appeared from East and upto West he sent out by them to sacred and incorrupted preaching of the Eternal Salvation. Amen!" (*Canon and the Text of the New Testament* by C.R. Gregory. p. 511).

2. *Sahif Qumran* (Scriptures of Qumran) by Sh. Abdul Qadir; Lahore, 1960.

3. *Islam and Christianity* by Mrs. Ulfat Aziz-us-Samad; chapter 7 "The Death of Jesus" Lahore 1960.

4. *Aik Nai Injil Ka Inkishaf* (Coptic Gospel)-by Sh. Abdul Qadir; Lahore, 1960. This gospel is said to have been compiled by St. Thomas.

5. *Ashab-i-Kahf ke Saheefey* (Dead Sea Scrolls) by Sh. Abdul Qadir; Lahore, 1960.

In October, 1967, Ch. Muhammad Zafrullah Khan, judge of Internatioal Court of Justice, during a speech in Toronto, Canada, made a statement that Jesus Christ did

not die on the cross but had fainted and thereafter migrated from Palestine to Kashmir and finally died and was buried in Srinagar, Kashmir. This roused the interest of International Press, and correspondents of leading papers in Europe and America contacted Mr. Aziz, Editor of *Roshni*, Srinagar, Kashmir to learn and verify the facts.

In November, 1967, Mr. J.N. Sathu, representative of the *Daily Telegraph*, London and the *New York Times*, Kh. Sanaullah Butt, Editor, *Daily Aftab*, Srinagar, Hakim Ghulam Mohi al-Din, the then Secretary of Auqaf Islamia, Srinagar, and Muhammad Rashid-ud-Din, Mufti Azam, Kashmir accompanied Mr. Aziz to the tomb of Yuz Asaf. They examined the premises and other evidence from the local people who unanimously told them that the tomb is of Prophet Yuz Asaf who had come to Kashmir during the reign of Raja Gopand. Mufti Muhammad Rashid-ud-Din was so much overwhelmed that he offered *nāfilah* prayers at the tomb.

A new book on the life of Mary, in the light of the Quran and other historical evidence, bearing the title *Hazrat Maryam bint 'Imran*, was written by Sh. Abdul Qadir, Lahore, 1971. It consists of 300 pages and is still in the form of a manuscript.

The same author wrote an article, "Jesus' Travels from Can'an to India", which was published in the monthly *Al Furqan* (Rabwah, February, March, 1971). It deals with the life-story of Appollonius of Tayana, a contemporary of Jesus Christ, as compiled by Philostratus and published in the book "Life of Appollonius" in 216 A.D. The life account of this saintly person, his teachings, curing of the sick, travels to eastern countries etc., are exactly like that of Jesus Christ. In 1912 Mr. J.M. Robert in his book, "Antiquity Unveiled" (Oriental Publishing Co., Philadelphia, USA) propounded the view that the 'historical Jesus', if found at all, is Appollonius of Tayana. It seems to us that the real facts about Jesus' escape from death on the cross and his later travels to eastern countries were quite well-known till the third century of the Christian era, and in order to distort them and to remove the halo of sacredness and supernaturalism attached to the person of Jesus Christ, these facts were purposely attributed to an ordinary person, Appollonius. But in 1970 came out another interesting book, "Spacemen in the Ancient East" by W. Raymond Drake, which expounds that the life of Appollonius, in fact, depicts the life of Jesus Christ. The author sums up: "Some Scholars while accepting the reality of the Man Jesus believe that he was a pious Jew, patriotic Leader of a Resistance Movement against the Romans for which He was crucified; others allege that Christ survived the cross and lived in Rome, then died in India. Cogent arguments suggest that the historical Jesus was really Appollonius of Tayana that great spiritual Teacher, who nineteen hundred years ago wandered throughout the known world, worked miracles, healed the sick and raised the dead, to whom Emperors built temples and worshipped as a God" (p. 18).

Further research on this subject of widespread interest continued to be made and in 1973, Sh. Abdul Qadir wrote an article, "Bhavishya Maha Purana". It was published in the monthly *al-Furqan* (Rabwah, February, 1973) with facsimile reproduction of the original text, together with its English translation. The Purana means ancient his-

tory. These consist of 18 volumes and are said to have been compiled by the great Hindu savant Maharishi Ved Vyas Ji and are considered sacred among the Hindus. The book was published for the first time in Bombay in 1910 under the orders of H.H, the Maharaja Sir Pratap Singh of Kashmir. Prof. D.D. Kosambi of the Tata Institute of Fundamental Research, Bombay, remarks about it: “—part of it must have been derived from ancient sources, now lost”. The ninth volume of this series is named Bhavishya Maha Purana, which means an ancient document giving prophecies about future; these prophecies and other analogous events were added to it from the second century (A.D.) onward. In this volume Jesus Christ’s visit to Kashmir and settlement of the Jewish tribes have been mentioned. (Ref. Sutta: *Bhavishya Maha Purana*, p. 283, Parva (ch.) III, Adhyaya (Section) II, Shloka (Verses) 9-31).

Then in 1972 the indefatigable Sh. Abdul Qadir published a new booklet, entitled *Masih Mashriq Main* (The Messiah in the East). It came out from Rabwah in September of that year. It was followed by an article, “Maqbarah Yuz Asaf ka Tarikhi Pas Manzar” (The Historical Background of the Tomb of Yuz Asaf), which was published in the daily *Al-Fazal*, Rabwah, of the 11th and 13th July, 1973.

The interest of International correspondents made Mr. Abdul Aziz feel the need of publishing an English translation of his special issue of weekly *Roshni*. Hence in 1973 appeared his brief but informative book, *Christ in Kashmir*.

In 1973 also came out an interesting and nicely printed book by Mumtaz Ahmad Faruqi, *The Crumbling of the Cross*, published by Ahmadiyya Anjuman Isha’at-i-Islam Lahore. It is mostly a compilation and summarization from *Jesus in Heaven on Earth*, researches made on the Holy Shroud found in a chapel at Turin, Italy, and scientific examination of the same published in a German book compiled and edited by Kurt Berna, “Jesus Nicht am Kreuz Gestorben” (Jesus did not die on the Cross). Mr. Faruqi admirably compiled the facts and evidence about the tomb of Mary at Murree (Pakistan). Originally the book was published in Urdu under the title, *Kasr-i-Saleeb*, in 1972.

The claim made by Hazrat Mirza Ghulam Ahmad, Founder of the Ahmadiyya Movement in Islam in 1890, that Jesus Christ did not die on the cross but went into swoon and was taken down and was nursed by his disciples and after recovering left Palestine is beginning to be accepted by Western scholars and medical experts. In 1902, the Founder of the Ahmadiyya Movement in an Arabic book, *Al-Huda*, while expressing his firm belief that the tomb at Srinagar is that of Jesus Christ, wrote: “If the grave is opened it will certainly reveal many evidences and proofs hitherto unknown. I pray to God that it may be done, so that those who deny the truth are exterminated”. (Qadian, 1902, p.117).

It will be of interest here to mention another good contribution to the subject: “Mysteries of Kashmir” by Mr. Muhammad Yasin, M.A., L.L.B. of Srinagar, published in 1972. The author writes in his Preface that this idea was first propounded in 1899 by the Founder of the Ahmadiyya Movement, Hazrat Mirza Ghulam Ahmad of

Qadian, but unfortunately, it became a subject of religious debate and controversy rather than a basis for further impartial research. The author considers the lack of appreciation on the part of Muslims of Hazrat Mirza Ghulam Ahmad's purely historical research as a historical sin...

In 1976 Andreas Faber-Kaiser of German extraction wrote a very interesting book *Jesus died in Kashmir* in Spanish. The English translation of the same was published in 1977 by Gordon & Cremonesi Ltd., London. Subsequently it was translated into French, Italian and Portuguese Languages. The Urdu translation of the same was published in 1986 by Oriental Publishers Manchester and printed in Bombay through Dar-ul-Ishaat Kutub -e-Islamia. This book deals with the mission of Jesus between the ages of 13 and 29 and among the lost tribes of Israel in the east, after his ordeal on the Cross at Calvary. At a later stage, he settled in Kashmir. It is reported, with supporting evidence and to have married and begotten children before his death in his ripe old age.

In 1983 there appeared *Jesus lived in India* by Holger Kersten, a German, in German language. This book ran in seven reprints in the same language, which broadly indicates its popularity among the German knowing readers. This book likewise covered the unknown life of Jesus before and after the Crucifixion, leading finally to his tomb in Srinagar. The English translation of the same published by Element Books Ltd. England appeared in 1986.

In 1984, Summit University Press, Malibu, California, U.S.A. published a very interesting and most important book, *The lost years of Jesus*. This book is compiled by Elizabeth Clare Prophet for the first time bringing together the testimonies of four eyewitnesses of the remarkable Buddhist documents found in the Himis monastery in Ladhak. These manuscripts were first discovered in 1887 by Nicolas Notovitch. The same were rediscovered by Swami Abhedananda, who published a Bengali translation of the Himis manuscript in 1929. Nicholas Roerich quoted the same verses in his travel diary of his Asian expedition in 1929, and Madame Elisabeth Caspari, who was presented a set of parchments by a lama at Himis, in 1939, with the words: "THESE BOOKS SAY YOUR JESUS WAS HERE." This book gives us the vivid description about the chronicles and legends of what Jesus (called as Saint Issa, in the East) did and said in India, Nepal, Ladakh and Tibet prior to his Palestinian Mission. This is a very important breakthrough, shaking the foundations of modern Christendom.

In close succession to the above publications came *The Fifth Gospel* published by Dastgir Publications Srinagar Kashmir in 1988. This book is jointly authored by Professor Fida Hassnain, (the retired Director of State Archives, Archaeology Research and Museums, Srinagar) and Dahan Lavi. This book reviews the findings of the earlier researchers so far and concludes that Jesus after his escape from Crucifixion on the Cross at Calvary, visited many countries in the east, finally settling in Kashmir where he is known as *Yuzu-Asaph* the prophet of *Bani-Israel*.

The additional information received during the process of reprinting the sixth

edition of *Jesus in Heaven on Earth*:

1. Book by A. Faber-Kaiser, *Jesus Died in Kashmir*, first published in England around 1981/82.

2. *The Holy Blood and the Holy Grail* by Michael Baigent, Richard Leigh and Henry Lincoln, London, 1982, suggested the existence in Europe of a royal blood line descended from Jesus.

3. Various books on early Christian history have been written by the Jewish scholar Hugh J Schonfield, including *The Passover Plot* (London, 1965), in which he argued that Jesus expected to survive crucifixion and was taken down from the cross alive but in a coma.

4. The British magazine *The Unexplained* published a series of two articles (in 1983) on the subject of Jesus in India. At least one of these articles was reproduced in *The Light*.

5. In the book *Jesus: the Evidence*, Ian Wilson writes:

“Perhaps because the gospel writers do not take account of it, the fifth hypothesis, that Jesus did not die on the cross, has been particularly favoured by sceptics in recent years. In *The Passover Plot* Hugh J. Schonfield advanced the ingenious theory that the sponge offered to Jesus on the cross (John 19: 29, 30) was soaked not in vinegar but in a drug to induce the appearance of death. This was, so that he could be taken to the tomb by Joseph of Arimathea and there resuscitated, but the lance thrust into Jesus’ side by the Romans caused the plot to misfire. According to Schonfield, the man seen by Mary Magdalen was simply someone who had been deputed to help revive Jesus, and the ‘resurrection’ was therefore nothing more than a case of mistaken identity, Jesus’ body having been quietly buried elsewhere.” (*Jesus: the Evidence*, London, 1984, page 140).

Wilson continues later on the same page, after mention of *The Holy Blood and the Holy Grail*:

“Today’s Ahmadiyya Muslims, only a little less fancifully, claim that Jesus even managed to get as far as India, and at Srinagar, Kashmir, visitors are shown a shrine purported to be his tomb.”

6. In the introduction to his book *The Essene Odyssey* (Element Books, Shaftesbury, Dorset, 1984), Hugh J. Schonfield writes:

“In the East, ancient records told of the saintly teacher Jo-asaph or Yus-Asaf, by some identified with Jesus, notably the founder of the Ahmadiyya Movement. It was held that Jesus had survived the cross and travelled to the East to bring the Messianic Message to the Lost Ten Tribes of Israel, themselves identified with the Afghans and certain of the Kashmiris. The tomb of this Yus-Asaph personality is shown at Srinagar in Kashmir and it has been claimed as the ultimate tomb of Jesus.

“A great deal has been written on this theme, and many venerable oriental texts cited, which I have employed with deep gratitude to the scholars of the Ahmadiyya Movement. The view that Jesus did not die on the cross was anciently asserted by Gnostic writers, and has recently been brought to the fore again in modern research, including that into the famous Turin Shroud, claimed by some to have covered the body of Jesus while in the tomb.” (page 10)

However, Schonfield does not agree that the tomb in Kashmir is that of Jesus, although he is certain that it is that of a great Jewish spiritual figure who migrated from Palestine.

Referring to the documents quoted in *Jesus in Heaven on Earth* he writes:

“Had the authorities quoted here identified the tomb of Yus-Asaf with that of the famed Jesus, an exalted figure in Islam, they would certainly have featured a matter of such importance. Their silence is eloquent. It is not disputed that this was proposed in the late nineteenth century. And we have to appreciate that accounts of the life and teaching of Jesus and of the Buddha did get interwoven in the East in the early Christian centuries following the arrival of missionaries. Certain parables are ascribed to both, and we have particularly been concerned with the part played by the spread of the tale of *Barlaam and Joasaph*.”

“However it needs to be stated that Professor F. M. Hassnain, Head of the Department of Archaeology at Srinagar found at the tomb on a slab used as a base for candles, and other deposits of candle wax, a crucifix and also a rosary. On the stone itself were carvings which appeared to be of the soles of two feet bearing nail wounds. These remains at least testified that Christians were among the many visitors to the tomb over a number of centuries, which would be quite appropriate if there was familiarity with the *Barlaam and Joasaph* story which in its Christian content had claimed Joasaph (Josaphat) as a great Christian saint to whom a holy day in the calendar had been assigned. The relics themselves, crucifix and rosary, could not be earlier than the Middle Ages, and of course no orthodox Christian, believing Jesus to be in heaven, could possibly have entertained the idea that his body was interred in Srinagar.” (pages 102-103)

The following important works relevant to the Sun-God Theory have been published since the fifth reprint of *Jesus in Heaven on Earth*.

- 1) *Jesus the Jew* by Geza Vermes., London 1973.
- 2) *The Myth of God Incarnate*, by John Hick, London, 1977.
- 3) *The Gospel of Jesus the Jew*, by Geza Vermes, Newcastle upon Tyne, 1981.

The above books support the arguments enunciated by Khwaja Nazir Ahmad in Chapter 5 of his book *Jesus in Heaven on Earth*.

APPENDIX 2

MUHAMMAD ASAD'S VIEW ON THE DEATH OF JESUS CHRIST

Thus, the Quran categorically denies the story of the crucifixion of Jesus. There exist, among Muslims, many fanciful legends telling us that at the last moment God substituted for Jesus a person closely resembling him (according to some accounts, that person was Judas), who was subsequently crucified in his place. However, none of these legends finds the slightest support in the Quran or in authentic Traditions, and the stories produced in this connection by the classical commentators of the Quran must be summarily rejected. They represent no more than confused attempts at “harmonizing” the Quranic statement that Jesus was crucified with the graphic description, in the Gospels, of his crucifixion. The story of crucifixion as much has been succinctly explained in the Qur’anic phrase *wa-lākin shubbiha lahum*, which I render as “but it only appeared to them as if it had been so”—implying that in the course of time, long after the time of Jesus, a legend had somehow grown up possibly under the then powerful influence of Mithraistic beliefs to the effect that he had died on the cross in order to atone for the “original sin” with which mankind is allegedly burdened; and this legend became so firmly established among the latter-day followers of Jesus that even his enemies, the Jews, began to believe it - albeit in a derogatory sense (for crucifixion was, in those times, a heinous form of death penalty reserved for the lowest of criminals). This, to my mind, is the only satisfactory explanation of the phrase *wa-lākin shubbiha lahum*, the more so as the expression *shubbiha li* idiomatically synonymous with *khuyyila li*, “(a thing) became a fancied image to me”, i.e., “in my mind”—in other words, “(it) seemed to me” see Qāmūs, art. *khayala*, as well as Lane II, 833, and IV, 1500).

Cf. 3:55, where God says to Jesus, “Verily, I shall cause thee to die, and shall exalt thee unto Me.” The verb *rafa’ ahū* (lit., “he raised him” or “elevated him”) has always, whenever the act of *raf’* (“elevating”) of a human being is attributed to God, the meaning of “honouring” or “exalting”. Nowhere in the Qur’an is there any warrant for the popular belief of many Muslims that God has “taken up” Jesus bodily into heaven. The expression “God exalted him unto Himself” in the above verse denotes the elevation of Jesus to the realm of God’s special grace - a blessing in which all prophets partake, as is evident from 19:57, where the verb *rafa’ nahu* (“We exalted him”) is used with regard to the Prophet Idris. See also Muhammad ‘Abdūh in *Manār* III, 316 f. and VI, 20 f.) The “nay” (*bal*) at the beginning of the sentence is meant to stress the contrast between the belief of the Jews that they put Jesus to a shameful death on the cross and the fact of God’s having “exalted him unto Himself”. (*The Message of the Quran*, translated and explained by Muhammad Asad, Vol. I, pp. 177-178, Muslim World League Mecca, European Representative: Islamic Centre, Geneva, 1964).

APPENDIX 3

MODERN SCIENTIFIC KNOWLEDGE AND THE QUR'AN'S REJECTION OF JESUS' DEATH ON THE CROSS¹

In 1955 Dr. J. G. Bourne, a senior anaesthetist of St. Thomas's Hospital and Salisbury Hospital Group, began investigating cases of patients fainting under general anesthesia in the dentist's chair. This can cause death: a man kept upright in a faint loses blood-supply to the brain. Dr. Bourne published this original research in 1957. Later, turning over his discoveries in his mind, he began to relate certain aspects to the facts of the Crucifixion and Resurrection. The theory that resulted was somewhat startling, but Dr. Bourne, himself a man of strong Christian belief, feels that it could make Christianity more attractive to people unable to accept the supernatural explanation of the Resurrection. He quotes the Archbishop of Canterbury, who wrote on the Resurrection: "There is need for the most scientific approach to historical proof that is possible." This is an abbreviated version of Dr. Bourne's paper on his theory, which is to be published elsewhere in more technical form.

"Normally, discussion of the Resurrection centers on the historical proofs (now generally accepted) of Jesus' subsequent appearances on earth. To question his actual death may be thought heresy—but there is reason to think that Jesus in fact fainted on the Cross, was believed dead, and recovered after a period of coma.

"Dr. C.C. P. Clark, writing in the *New York Medical Record* in 1908, suggested that Jesus' apparent death might have been a fainting attack. In 1935 Professor S. Weiss, an American authority on fainting, pointed out that fainting was the usual cause of death in victims of crucifixion, and this is now accepted among medical scientists.

"The essential feature of fainting is a fall in arterial blood pressure, caused by active dilation of the smaller arteries of the body, mainly in the muscles. Blood then gets away from the arterial side of the circulation with greatly decreased resistance. At the same time the heart is slowed, and may stop for several seconds. The onset may come without warning, though not usually, and there may be a sense of impending death.

"Blood pressure falls precipitously, the brain's oxygen supply is reduced, consciousness is lost and the subject falls down. Breathing is shallow, the pupils are dilated, and the appearance death-like: not even the deepest coma so closely resembles death.

"The abolition of muscle power which causes the fall is a safeguard to the brain, which is readily damaged by oxygen-lack. In the horizontal position, blood-pressure is restored, and consciousness returns. However, deathly pallor may continue for an hour or more—due to release of pituitary hormone, part of the reflex response.

"If the subject is kept upright: (a) blood-pressure may spontaneously return above

1. Reproduced by kind permission of the Editor, *The Sunday Times*, London for 24 January 1965, and that of the author, Dr. J. G. Bourne.

fainting level; (b) the subject may recover momentarily and faint again, perhaps repeatedly; (c) he may continue in the faint, with progressively falling blood-pressure, but still with a survival chance; or he may die instantaneously because the heart stopped beating at the onset and did not resume. In fatal cases, however, death is usually due to brain damage from lack of oxygen, and may come in two or three minutes, or be delayed even for weeks.

RECOVERY

“Depending on the blood pressure level and the length of time he is kept upright, the survivor may suffer stupor or coma with recovery after a few hours or days, various degrees or permanent intellectual impairment, or profound dementia and delayed death. Such cases are not uncommon in medicine.

“Some years ago investigation was made by the writer into certain accidents which occurred in dentistry and discovered that patients, under light anesthesia with nitrous-oxide, might develop a fainting attack. (Dr. Bourne published this research in his book *Nitrous Oxide in Dentistry*). Under a general anesthetic, this was unnoticed until, quite suddenly, the patient developed all the appearances of being dead. At that time the importance of getting the patient flat was not understood, and when eventually lifted from chair to the floor, he would lie pallid and inert until consciousness slowly returned. Many such cases were discovered: the coma lasting half an hour, several hours, a day or two, or in one extreme case, two weeks. Some cases were fatal.

WALKING

“The Crucifixion (according to the Gospels and Renan’s *Life of Jesus*) took place around noon, and Jesus’ apparent death occurred suddenly about 3 p.m. He was taken down and laid in the tomb, but at dawn on Sunday, forty hours later, was no longer there. Five times that day He was seen walking and talking to people: first with Mary Magdalene just after dawn, who initially did not recognize Him. He also had a long discourse with disciples before being recognized.

“The period that the upright position could be held in a faint and allow recovery of consciousness after relatively few hours’ coma would depend on how low blood-pressure fell: this determining the degree of the brain’s oxygen-lack. The level in his case cannot be guessed, but it seems the fainting-interval on the cross was short. Some advantage would be gained by the fact that on fainting the head would fall forward, thus lessening the distance from heart to brain, and improving blood flow. St. John says the Jews did not want the bodies to remain on the cross for the coming Sabbath so they asked Pilate to have them taken down. ‘The soldiers accordingly came to the first of his fellow-victims and to the second, and broke their legs; but when they came to Jesus, they found that he was already dead, so they did not break his legs. But one of the soldiers pierced his side with a lance, and at once there was a flood of blood and water.’”

SYMPATHETIC

“The soldiers were acting under Pilate’s orders, and presumably would have forthwith taken down the bodies. (The centurion, sympathetic to Jesus, would probably have seen that it was done promptly.) Renan says that when Joseph asked Pilate for Jesus’s body, it had already been taken down. It is certain that the soldiers did not break his legs—the usual method of applying the *coup-de-grace* to victims.

“Next, how did it happen that blood flowed from the wound? In a dead body, blood will ooze from cut veins, but there is not the flow of blood described by St. John’s description. (In operating for cardiac arrest, a flow would rightly be taken as evidence that the heart was still beating, and the surgeon would not proceed to open the chest.) In fainting, this is just what would be expected, with the small muscle arteries dilated. The lance could hardly have failed to pierce muscle, and the wound was probably well below heart level, where blood-pressure would be appreciable even in a faint.

“Apart from the likeness of the faint to death, death is not always easily diagnosed: mistakes are made even today. I know personally of two persons pronounced dead by doctors revived in the mortuary—one of them left hospital thirteen days later on foot. In Jesus, death appears to have been diagnosed by soldiers: what could be more understandable than a mistake during the tumult of this terrible event?

CHANGED

“Nor is it surprising that close associates should have failed initially to recognize Jesus afterwards. He would have looked an ill man, much changed. It might be argued that during the post-Crucifixion period, his words lacked somewhat their former vigor and brilliance: can it be that cerebral anoxia on the cross had left its mark?

“A great many people must have doubted the reality of Jesus, death upon the Cross, or else the literal truth of the Resurrection. That he fainted, and did not die, was suggested by Dr. Clark three-quarters of a century ago, and according to Renan, recovery after crucifixion was known to the ancients. If there was nothing supernatural about the reappearance of Jesus, need that be an obstacle to the acceptance of His teachings? His life is sublime without physical myths: nothing can take away the miracles of the spirit.”

(*The Islamic Review*, Woking, England, April 1965.)

٢- وفي سورة الداء، قوله تعالى: « وَقَوْلِهِمْ إِنَّا قَتَلْنَا الْمَسِيحَ عِيسَى ابْنَ مَرْيَمَ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ وَمَا قَتَلُوهُ وَمَا صَلَبُوهُ وَلَكِنْ شُبِّهَ لَهُمْ، وَإِنَّ الَّذِينَ اخْتَلَفُوا فِيهِ لَبِئْسَ أَفْئُكُهُمْ، مَا لَهُمْ بِهِ مِنْ عِلْمٍ إِلَّا اتِّبَاعَ الظَّنِّ وَمَا قَتَلُوهُ يَقِينًا، بَلْ رَفَعَهُ اللَّهُ إِلَيْهِ وَكَانَ اللَّهُ عَزِيزًا حَكِيمًا »^(١)

٣- وفي سورة المائدة قوله تعالى: « وَإِذْ قَالَ اللَّهُ يَا عِيسَى ابْنَ مَرْيَمَ أَأَنْتَ قُلْتَ لِلنَّاسِ اتَّخِذُونِي وَأُمِّي آلِهَتَيْنِ مِنْ دُونِ اللَّهِ قَالِ: سُبْحَانَكَ، مَا يَكُونُ لِي أَنْ أَقُولَ مَا لَيْسَ لِي بِمَعْنٍ إِنْ كُنْتُ قُلْتُهُ فَقَدْ عَلِمْتَهُ تَعْلَمَ مَا فِي قَلْبِي وَلَا أَعْلَمُ مَا فِي قَلْبِكَ، إِنَّكَ أَنْتَ عَلَّامُ الْغُيُوبِ . مَا قُلْتُ لَهُمْ إِلَّا مَا أَمَرْتَنِي بِهِ: أَنْ اعْبُدُوا اللَّهَ رَبِّي وَرَبَّكُمْ وَكُنْتُمْ عَلَيْهِمْ شَهِيدًا مَا دُمْتُمْ فِيهِمْ فَلَمَّا تَوَفَّيْتَنِي كُنْتُ أَنْتَ الرَّقِيبَ عَلَيْهِمْ وَأَنْتَ عَلَى كُلِّ شَيْءٍ شَهِيدٌ »^(٢)

هذه هي الآيات التي عرض القرآن فيها لنهاية شأن عيسى مع قومه .

والآية الأخيرة (آية المائدة) تذكر لنا شأنًا آخر وبأمر يتعلق بعبادة قومه له ولأمته في الدنيا وقد سأله الله عنها . وهي تقرر على لسان عيسى عليه السلام أنه لم يقل إلا ما أمره الله به : (اعْبُدُوا اللَّهَ رَبِّي وَرَبَّكُمْ) وأنه كان شهيدًا عليهم مدة إقامته بينهم، وأنه لا يعلم ما حدث منهم بعد أن (توفاه الله)

صلى الترنى :

وكلمة (توفى) قد وردت في القرآن كثيرًا بمعنى الموت حتى صار معناها المعنى هو الغالب عليها المتبادر منها، ولم تستعمل في غيرها هذا المعنى إلا وبجانبها

(٢) الآيات ١١٦، ١١٧ .

(١) الآيات ١٥٧، ١٥٨ .

ما يصرفنا عن هذا المعنى المتبادر : « قُلْ يَتَوَفَّاكُم مَّلَكُ الْمَوْتِ الَّذِي ذُكِّرَ بِكُمْ » (١) ، « إِنَّ الَّذِينَ تَوَفَّاهُمُ الْمَلَائِكَةُ ظَالِمِي أَنْفُسِهِمْ » (٢) ، « وَلَوْ تَرَى إِذْ يَتَوَفَّى الَّذِينَ كَفَرُوا الْمَلَائِكَةُ » (٣) ، « تَوَفَّاهُمْ رُسُلُنَا » (٤) . « وَمِنْكُمْ مَنْ يُتَوَفَّى » (٥) . « حَتَّى يَتَوَفَّاهُمْ الْمَوْتُ » (٦) . « تَوَفِّي سَلِيمًا وَالْحَقِّي بِالصَّالِحِينَ » (٧) .

ومن حق كلمة « توفيني » في الآية أن نجعل هنا المعنى المتبادر وهو الإمامة العادية التي يعرفها الناس ويدركها من اللفظ والسياق الناطقون بالضاد . وإذن الآية لو لم يتصل بها غيرها في تقرير نهاية عيسى مع قومه لما كان هناك مبرر للقول بأن عيسى حي لم يموت .

ولا سبيل إلى القول بأن الوفاة هنا مراد بها وفاة عيسى بعد نزوله من السماء بناء على زعم من يرى أنه حي في السماء ، وأنه سينزل منها آخر الزمان ، لأن الآية ظاهرة في تحديد علاقته بقومه هو لا بالقوم الذين يكونون آخر الزمان وم قوم محمد باتفاق لا قوم عيسى .

معنى « رفع الله يديه » : وهل هو إلى السماء ؟

أما آية النساء فإيها تقول « بل رضعه الله إليه » وقد فسرها بعض المفسرين بل جهورهم بالرفع إلى السماء ، ويضربون : إن الله ألقى شبهه على غيره ، ورضعه بجمده إلى السماء ، فهو حي فيها وسينزل منها آخر الزمان ، فيقتل الخنزير ويكسر الصليب ، ويمتدنون في ذلك :

أولاً : على روايات تفيد نزول عيسى بعد الدجال ، وهي روايات مضطربة مختلفة في ألفاظها ومعانيها اختلافاً لا مجال معه للجمع بينها ، وقد نص على ذلك

(٢) الآية ١٢ من سورة النساء .

(٤) الآية ٦١ من سورة الأنعام .

(٦) الآية ١٥ من سورة النساء .

(١) الآية ١١ من سورة السجدة .

(٣) الآية ٥٠ من سورة الأعراف .

(٥) الآية ٥ من سورة الحج .

(٧) الآية ١٠١ من سورة يوسف .

علماء الحديث . وهي فوق ذلك من رواية وهب بن منه وكعب الأجار وهما من أهل الكتاب الذين اعتنقوا الإسلام ، وقد عرفت درجتها في الحديث عند علماء الجرح والتعديل .

ثانياً : على حديث مروى عن أبي هريرة اقتصر فيه على الإخبار بنزول عيسى ، وإذا صح هذا الحديث فهو حديث آحاد . وقد أجمع العلماء على أن أحاديث الآحاد لا تفيد عقيدة ولا يصح الاعتماد عليها في شأن الغيبات .

ثالثاً : على ما جاء في حديث المراج من أن محمداً - صلى الله عليه وسلم - حينما صعد إلى السماء ، وأخذ يفتنحها واحدة بعد واحدة فتفتح له ويدخل ، رأى عيسى عليه السلام هو وابن خالته يحيى في السماء الثانية . ويكفينا في نوهين هنا المستند ما قرره كثير من شراح الحديث في شأن المراج وفي شأن اجتماع محمد صلى الله عليه وسلم بالأنبياء ، وأنه كان اجتماعاً روحياً لا جسامياً « انظر فتح الباري وزاد المعاد وغيرها » .

ومن الطرف أنهم يستدلون على أن معنى الرفع في الآية هو رفع عيسى بجسده إلى السماء بحديث المراج ، بينما ترى فريقاً منهم يستدل على أن اجتماع محمد بعيسى في المراج كان اجتماعاً جدياً بقوله تعالى : « بَلِّ رَقَعَهُ اللهُ إِلَيْهِ » وهكذا ينحنون الآية دليلاً على ما يفهمونه من الحديث حين يكونون في تفسير الحديث ، وينحنون الحديث دليلاً على ما يفهمونه من الآية حين يكونون في تفسير الآية .

الرفع في آية آل عمران :

« وَنَحْنُ إِذَا رَجَعْنَا إِلَى قَوْلِهِ نَبَالِي : « إِنِّي مُتَوَقِّفٌ وَرَافِعٌ إِلَيْ »
في آية آل عمران مع قوله « بَلِّ رَقَعَهُ اللهُ إِلَيْهِ » في آيات النساء وجدنا

الثانية إخباراً عن تحقيق الوعد الذى تضمنته الأولى ، وقد كان هذا الوعد بالتوفية والرفع والتطهير من الذين كفروا ، فإذا كانت الآية الثانية قد جاءت خالية من التوفية والتطهير ، وانصرت على ذكر الرفع إلى الله فإنه يجب أن يلاحظ فيها ما ذكر فى الأولى جمعاً بين الآيتين .

والمعنى أن الله توفى عبدي ورفعه إليه وطهره من الذين كفروا .

وقد فسر الأوسى قوله تعالى « إِنِّي مُتَوَفِّيكَ » بوجوه منها — وهو أظهرها — إني متوفى أجلك وبميتك حنف أنفك لا أسلط عليك من يقتلك ، وهو كناية عن عصمته من الأعداء وما هم بصدده من الفتك به عليه السلام ؛ لأنه يلزم من استبقاء الله أجله وموته حنف أنه ذلك .

وظاهر أن الرفع — الذى يكون بعد التوفية — هو رفع المسكنة لارفع الجسد ، خصوصاً وقد جاء بجانبه قوله : « وَطَهَّرَكَ مِنَ الَّذِينَ كَفَرُوا » مما يدل على أن الأمر أمر تشریف وتكريم .

وقد جاء الرفع فى القرآن كثيراً بهذا المعنى : « فِي بُيُوتِ الَّذِينَ أَنزَلْنَا أَنْ تُرْفَعَ » . « تُرْفَعُ دَرَجَاتٍ مِّنْ نَّشَأٍ » . « وَرَفَعْنَا لَكَ ذِكْرَكَ » .

« وَرَفَعْنَا مَسَاجِدَهُمْ عَلِيًّا » . « بَرَفَعْنَا اللَّهُ الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا » . الخ .
وإذن فالمعبر بقوله « وَرَافِعُكَ إِلَيَّ » وقوله « بل رفعه الله إليه »

كالتعبير فى قولم لحن فلان بل رفيع الأعلى وفى « إن الله معنا » وفى « عنه ملك مقدر » وكلها لا يفهم منها سوى معنى الإعانة والحفظ والتحول فى الكنف القمى . فنأين تؤخذ كلمة السماء من كلمة « إليه » اللهم إن هذا لظلم لتعبير القرآنى الواضح خضوعاً تقصص وروايات لم يتم على اللحن

بها — فضلاً عن اليقين — برهان ولاشبه برهان !

الفهم المتبادر من الآيات :

وبعد . فاعيسى إلا رسول قد خلت من قبله الرسل ، لاصبه قومه المداء ، وظهرت على وجوههم بوادر الشر بالنسبة إليه ، فالتجأ إلى الله — شأن الأنبياء والمرسلين — فأنقذه الله بمرزئه وحكته وخيب مكر أعدائه . وهذا هو ما تضمنته الآيات « فَلَمَّا أَحَسُّ عِيسَى مِنْهُمُ الْكُفْرَ قَالَ مَنْ أَنْصَارِي إِلَى اللَّهِ » إلى آخرها ، بين الله فيها قوة مكره بالنسبة إلى مكرم ، وأن مكرم في اغتيال عيسى قد ضاع أمام مكر الله في حفظه وعممته إذ قال « يَا عِيسَى ابْنُ مَرْيَمَ كَرِهَ اللَّهُ مُطَائِرِكَ مِنَ الَّذِينَ كَفَرُوا » فهو يبشره بإنجائه من مكرم ورد كيدهم في نحرهم ، وأنه سينتوفي أجله حتى يموت خنفاً أنه من غير قتل ولا صلب ، ثم يرفعه الله إليه .

وهذا هو ما يفهمه القارئ من الآيات الواردة في شأن نهاية عيسى مع قومه حتى وقف على سنة الله مع أنبيائه حين يتألب عليهم خصومهم ، ومعنى خلا ذمته من تلك الروايات التي لا ينبغي أن نجس في القرآن ، ولست أدري كيف يكون إقناذ عيسى بطريق انزاعه من بينهم ، ورفعه بجسده إلى السماء مكرآ ؟ وكيف يوصف بأنه خير من مكرم مع أنه شيء ليس في استطاعتهم أن يقاوموه ، شيء ليس في قدرة البشر ؟

ألا إنه لا يتحقق مكر في مقابلة مكر إلا إذا كان جارياً على أسلوبه غير خارج عن مقتضى العادة فيه . وقد جاء مثل هذا في شأن محمد صلى الله عليه وسلم « وَإِذْ بَمَكْرٍ بِكَ الَّذِينَ كَفَرُوا لِيُثْبِتُوكَ أَوْ يَقْتُلُوكَ أَوْ يُخْرِجُوكَ وَيَمْكُرُونَ وَيَمْكُرُ اللَّهُ وَاللَّهُ خَيْرُ الْمَاكِرِينَ »

رفع عيسى ليس عقيدة يكفر منكرها:

والخلاصة من هذا البحث :

١ - أنه ليس في القرآن الكريم ، ولا في السنة المطهرة مستند يصلح لتكوين عقيدة يطمئن إليها القلب بأن عيسى رفع بجسمه إلى السماء وأنه حي إلى الآن فيها وأنه سينزل منها آخر الزمان إلى الأرض .

٢ - أن كل ما تنفيده الآيات الواردة في هذا الشأن هو وعد الله عيسى بأنه متوفيه أجله ورافعه إليه وعاصمه من الذين كفروا ، وأن هذا الوعد قد تحقق فلم يقتله أعداؤه ولم يصلبوه ، ولكن وفاه الله أحله ورفعه إليه .

٣ - أن من أنكر أن عيسى قد رفع بجسمه إلى السماء ، وأنه فيها حي إلى الآن ، وأنه سينزل منها آخر الزمان ، فإنه لا يكون بذلك منكرا لما ثبت بدليل قطعي ، فلا يخرج عن إسلامه وإيمانه ، ولا ينبغي أن يحكم عليه بالردة ، بل هو مسلم مؤمن ، إذا مات فهو من المؤمنين ، يصلى عليه كما يصلى على المؤمنين ، ويدفن في مقابر المؤمنين ، ولا شية في إيمانه عند الله ، والله بعباده خبير بصير .

Shaikh Mahmud Shaltut has authoritatively answered the questions. Abdul Fattah translates *twaffa* as describing physical death of Jesus.¹ Yusuf Ali also stated that Jesus “was, when he died taken up to God.”² It has already been mentioned that according to the Holy Qur-’an all human beings must die and die on this earth.³ So emphatic is the Holy Qur-’an that the Holy Prophet was told:

And We granted abiding for ever to no mortal before thee.⁴

And, it is further stated that the only exception to this general rule is God Himself,⁵ Jesus comes within the phrase “before thee.” Speaking of the earlier prophets the Holy Qur-’an says:

And We did not send before thee any but men to whom We sent revelation...And We did not make their bodies not eating the food and they were not to abide (for ever).⁶

The Holy Qur-’an establishes that Jesus was a mortal for he ate earthly food⁷ and prayed for it.⁸ There are various direct references to the death of Jesus in the Holy Qur-’an, but I will quote only one:

Who then could control anything as against Allah when He wished to destroy the Messiah, son of Mary, and his mother and all those on the earth.⁹

1. Pp. 126, 159, 258.

2. See Part III, p. ____, n. 396. But in the single volume, the words “when he died” were omitted though the word *twaffa* in another place was translated as “gathered” death. In discussing Verse 157 of Ch. IV Yusuf Ali says: “It is not profitable to discuss the doubts and conjectures of the early Christian or Muslim theologians.” To whom and why it is not *profitable* has not been explained by him, but the reason for the omission can well be guessed.

3. *Ubi. Sup.*, 148, 149, *cf.* the Holy Qur-’an, LXXX: 18-21.

4. The Holy Qur-’an, XXI:34.

5. *Ibid.*, XXV:58.

6. *Ibid.*, XXI:7-8.

7. *Ibid.*, V:75; *cf.* Matt., IX: 17.

8. *Ibid.*, IV:114; *cf.* Matt., VI:11.

9. *Ibid.*, V:17.